

**AUDITOR INDEPENDENCE AND EARNINGS QUALITY OF LISTED
COMPANIES IN NIGERIA (2006-2013)**

Mary Kehinde SALAWU
B.Sc. (Hons) Accounting, Ife, MBA Ife, M.Phil. Ife, ACA, ACIT
ADP12/13/H/1315

**A Ph.D. THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE DEPARTMENT OF MANAGEMENT AND
ACCOUNTING, FACULTY OF ADMINISTRATION, OBAFEMI AWOLowo
UNIVERSITY, ILE-IFE, NIGERIA, IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENTS FOR THE AWARD OF THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF
PHILOSOPHY (Ph.D.) IN ACCOUNTING**

2016

CERTIFICATION

I certify that Mary Kehinde Salawu carried out this research work under my supervision in the Department of Management and Accounting, Faculty of Administration, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria.

.....
Prof. T.O. Asaolu

(Supervisor)

Department of Management and Accounting
Awolowo University
Nigeria

.....
Date

Obafemi
Ile-Ife,

.....
Prof. A.A. Agboola

Head of Department

Department of Management and Accounting
Awolowo University
Nigeria

.....
Date

Obafemi
Ile-Ife,

**OBAFEMI AWOLOWO UNIVERSITY, ILE-IFE, NIGERIA
HEZEKIAH OLUWASANMI LIBRARY
POSTGRADUATE THESIS**

AUTHORISATION TO COPY

AUTHOR: SALAWU, Mary Kehinde
TITLE: AUDITOR INDEPENDENCE AND EARNINGS QUALITY OF LISTED
COMPANIES IN NIGERIA (2006-2013)
DEGREE: Ph. D. (Accounting)
YEAR: 2016

I, SALAWU, Mary Kehinde hereby authorize the Hezekiah Oluwasanmi Library to copy my thesis in whole or in part, in response to request from individual researchers and organizations for the purpose of private study or research.

Signature

Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My heart-felt gratitude goes to my Heavenly Father, the Living and the Holy God; He is from Everlasting and the Great God of wonders. He declares the end from the beginning. He knows the way that I go and He directs my path. Without Him, I am nothing and I can do nothing, so through Him, this work was done and I return the Praises to Him. “TO YOU BE GLORY OH MY GOD FOR EVER AND EVER”.

I acknowledge and appreciate the tremendous role of my supervisor, Professor T.O. Asaolu in bringing my dream to fruition. Only God knows how best to reward you for your sacrifice of time, advice, encouragement and timely intervention at every challenging instance in ensuring the success of this thesis; I cannot thank you enough sir. “You are one in thousands”. To my Head of Department, Professor A.A. Agboola, a man who is highly interested in the success of his subordinates: Sir, “You are a blessing to this generation” God Almighty will reward you and your generations to come. I am very grateful to Prof. P. O. Jegede, Dr. A. A. Adegboye, Dr. A. G. Aremo, Dr. A. Adedokun, Dr. O. B. Obembe, Mr. Awe O. O. and Mr Mobolaji J. W for their timely contributions to the success of the work. My appreciation also goes to all academic and non-academic staff of the Department.

A friend in need is a friend indeed. Dr. & Pastor E.A Olajubu, Pastor and Mummy T. F. Ojo, Pastor O.O Olatokun, Pastor and Mummy Olagunju, Pastor and Mummy Adeoye, Pastor and Mummy Atolagbe, Pastor and Mummy Famakinwa, Pastor and Mummy Adedeji, Pastor and Mummy Adewole, Mr. and Mrs M. Salawu, Olabisi Prudence, Mary, Joshua, Yinka and my project students, 2014/2015 Session, all contributed practically and tremendously to the successful completion of this work. My God shall not forget your labour of love which you all

bestowed on me. I cannot but appreciate the prayer support of all my brethren in the DLBC, Ife-Region and the other brethren whose names are known to God. “How sweet and how pleasant is it for brethren to dwell together in unity”.

I thank God for the shepherd-heart of my Region Overseer- Pastor Fola Ajala and our Mummy in the Lord, Mummy Ajala who prophesied Academic Excellence in to my life. They are always very supportive and happy seeing their children in the faith advancing in their chosen career. Sir and Ma, the godly seed you have planted shall not wither and your generation shall continually enjoy the supply and the support of God and of men in Jesus name.

Again, Mrs. B. Ojo (Mummy Mary), you are a neighbour closer than a blood-brother. You played a significant and dignifying role in my life. My Great God of Heaven shall engrave your good work upon the platter of Gold which shall not be blotted out and shall reward you and your family hundred-fold. You are to me “THE LOVE OF GOD EXEMPLIFIED”

I sincerely appreciate the true love and labour of my Husband through thick and thin. He is a true representative of God to me. I cannot quantify his effort, absolute support, words of encouragement and inspiration before and during the time of putting this thesis together. He is the man behind the curtain of this achievement. You will live to eat the fruit of your labour in Jesus name. My beloved children are not the least on the list. I am happy for all their prayers for me and their immeasurable love and support in my life and career till this moment. You shall not die but live to declare the glory of God in the land of the living in Jesus name. (Amen).

Mary Kehinde SALAWU

DEDICATION

I dedicate this work to God the Father, God the Son and God the Holy Spirit.

OBAFEMI AWOLOWO UNIVERSITY

TABLE OF CONTENT

Title Page.....	i
Certification.....	ii
Authorization	iii
Acknowledgements.....	iv
Dedication.....	vi
Table of Content.....	vii
List of Tables.....	xi
List of Figures.....	xii
Abstract.....	xiii
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Background to the Study.....	1
1.2 Statement of the Problem.....	5
1.3 Research Questions.....	10
1.4 Objectives of the Study.....	10
1.5 Significance of the Study.....	11
1.6 Scope of the Study.....	11
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1 Conceptual Review.....	13
2.1.1 Audit Report.....	13
2.1.2 Auditor Independence.....	15
2.1.3 Audit Committee.....	19
2.1.4 Earnings Quality.....	23
2.1.5 Earnings Smoothing and Management.....	27
2.2 Theoretical Review.....	29
2.2.1 Agency Theory.....	29



2.2.2 Stakeholder Theory.....	32
2.2.3 Stewardship Theory.....	34
2.2.4 Institutional Theory.....	36
2.2.5 Signalling Theory.....	37
2.2.6 Prospect Theory.....	40
2.2.7 Theory of Inspired Confidence.....	42
2.2.8 Positive Accounting Theory.....	43
2.2.8.1. Bonus Plan Hypothesis.....	45
2.2.8.2. Debt/Equity Hypothesis.....	45
2.2.8.3. Political Cost Hypothesis.....	46
2.2.9 Social Exchange Theory.....	46
2.3 Empirical Review.....	47
2.3.1 Auditor Independence and Earnings Quality.....	47
2.3.2 Audit Committee and Earnings Quality.....	56
2.3.3. Determinants of Auditor Independence.....	61
2.3.5 Summary of the Literature.....	71
2.4 Theoretical Framework.....	73
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY	
3.1 Area of Study.....	77
3.2 Population, Sample Size and Sampling Technique.....	77
3.3 Research Design.....	79
3.4 Sources of Data.....	80
3.5 Research Instrument.....	80
3.6 Validation of Research Instrument.....	81
3.7 Model specification.....	81
3.7.1. Auditor Independence, Audit Committee and Earnings Quality.....	81
3.7.2 Audit Committee and Earnings Quality.....	85
3.7.3 Measurement of Variables.....	86
3.7.4 Determinants of Auditor Independence.....	87
3.8 Data Analysis Technique.....	90
3.8.1 Appraisal of the effectiveness of auditor independence regulations.....	90

3.8.2	Trend analysis of earnings quality among listed companies in Nigeria.....	91
3.8.3	Factors Influencing Auditor Independence and the impact of auditor independence and audit committee on earnings quality.....	91
3.8.4	Generalised Method of Moment.....	92

CHAPTER FOUR: APPRAISAL OF AUDITOR INDEPENDENCE REGULATION IN NIGERIA

4.1	Demographic Characteristics of the Respondent	96
4.1.1	Response rate.....	96
4.1.2	Gender of Respondents.....	99
4.1.3	Age Distribution.....	99
4.1.4	Years of Service.....	99
4.1.5	Academic and Professional Qualification	99
4.1.6	Occupational and Professional Status.....	101
4.2	Effectiveness of Auditor Independence Regulations in Nigeria.....	104
4.2.1	Strength of the Effectiveness of Auditor Independence Regulations.....	109
4.3	An Overview of Institutional Regulatory Framework of Auditor Independence in Nigeria.....	109
4.3.1	The Securities and Exchange Commission.....	111
4.3.1.1	The Audit Committee.....	112
4.3.1.3	Whistle-blowing Policy.....	114
4.3.1.4	Rotation of External Auditors.....	115
4.3.2	Companies and Allied Matter 2004.....	115
4.3.2.1	Appointment of auditors.....	116
4.3.2.2	Qualification of auditors.....	117
4.3.2.3	Auditors' report.....	118
4.3.2.4	Auditors' duties and powers.....	119
4.3.2.5	Remuneration of auditors.....	120

4.3.3	Financial Reporting Council of Nigeria.....	120
4.3.4	The Institute of Chartered Accountants of Nigeria (ICAN) and Association of National Accountants of Nigeria (ANAN).....	122
4.3.5	Global Development.....	123
4.3.5.1	The Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002.....	124
4.3.5.1.1	Services outside the Scope of Practice of Auditors.....	125
4.3.5.1.2	Audit Partner Rotation.....	127
4.3.5.1.3	Auditor Reports to Audit Committees.....	127
4.3.5.1.4	Conflicts of Interest.....	128
4.4	A Critique of Auditor Independence Regulations in Nigeria.....	128

**CHAPTER FIVE: AUDITOR INDEPENDENCE, AUDIT COMMITTEE AND
EARNINGS QUALITY OF LISTED COMPANIES IN NIGERIA**

5.1	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality.....	135
5.2	Factors Influencing Auditor Independence in Nigeria.....	166
5.2.1	Qualitative factor Analysis of factors influencing auditor independence.	166
5.2.1.1	Strength of the Factors Influencing Auditor Independence.....	173
5.2.2	Quantitative factor Analysis of factors influencing auditor independence	175
5.2.2.1	Sargan Test and Serial Correlation Test	175
5.2.2.2	Descriptive Analysis.....	175
5.2.2.3	Multi-collinearity Test.....	178
5.2.2.4	Unit Root Test.....	181
5.2.2.5	GMM Estimation of Factors Influencing Auditor Independence.....	181
5.3	Influence of Audit Fee on Earnings Quality of listed companies in Nigeria.....	186
5.3.1	Sargan Test and Arellano-Bond Serial Correlation Test.....	187
5.3.2	Descriptive Analysis.....	187
5.3.3	Multi-collinearity Test.....	189
5.3.4	Unit Root Test Result.....	189
5.3.5	GMM Estimation of the Influence of Audit Fee on Earnings quality.....	192

5.4	Influence of Audit Committee characteristics on Earnings quality of listed companies in Nigeria.....	195
5.4.1	Sargan Test and Serial Correlation Test	195
5.4.2	Descriptive Analysis.....	195
5.4.3	Multi-collinearity Test.....	197
5.4.4	Unit Root Test.....	200
5.4.5	The Influence of Audit Committee on Earnings quality.....	200
CHAPTER SIX: SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS		
6.1	Summary of Findings	206
6.2	Conclusion and Policy Implications	212
6.3	Recommendations.....	214
6.4	Contribution to Knowledge.....	216
6.5	Limitations of the Study.....	217
6.6	Suggestions for further studies.....	218
	References.....	219
	APPENDICES.....	247
	Appendix I: Questionnaire.....	247
	Appendix II: Frequency Tables.....	250
	Appendix III: List of Sampled Firms.....	262
	Appendix IV: Descriptive and Inferential Statistics.....	263

LIST OF TABLES

3.1	Population and Sample Size.....	79
3.2	Measurement of Variables.....	87
3.3	Measurement of Variables (Auditor Independence).....	90
4.1	Demographic Characteristics of the respondents.....	97
4.2	Effectiveness of Auditor Independence Regulations in Nigeria.....	108
4.3	Strength of the effectiveness of Auditor Independence Regulation.....	111
5.1	Trend analysis of earnings quality among the listed companies in Nigeria.....	136
5.2.	Percentage Change in Earnings Quality between 2006 and 2013.....	140
5.3	Respondents' Perception of Factors Influencing Auditor Independence	167
5.4	Banks/Firms Audited by the Big Four Accounting Firms	171
5.5	Ranking of Factors Influencing Auditor Independence	174
5.6	Descriptive Statistics	176
5.7	Correlation Analysis	179
5.8	Unit Root Test Results	180
5.9	Estimation Results of the Dynamic GMM Model for the Factors influencing auditor independence in Nigeria	183
5.10	Descriptive Statistics	188
5.11	Correlation Analysis	190
5.12	Unit Root Results	191
5.13	Estimation Results of the Dynamic GMM Model for the effect of Audit fees on Earnings Quality	193
5.14	Descriptive Statistics	196
5.15	Correlation Analysis	198
5.16	Unit root test.....	199
5.17	Estimation Results of the Dynamic GMM for the Influence of audit committee characteristics on earnings quality of listed companies in Nigeria	203

LIST OF FIGURES

2.1	Signaling process	39
2.2	Prospect utility function	41
2.3	Schematic Diagram of the Relevance of Agency Theory to Organizational Control Mechanisms.....	75
4.1	Respondents rate on group basis.....	98
4.2	Gender distribution of the respondents	100
4.3	Respondents years of service	102
4.4	Occupational and Professional Status.....	103
5.1	Trend of Earnings Quality (EQ) of Nigerian Listed Companies during 2006-2013...137	
5.2	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Agriculture Sector.....	141
5.3	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Conglomerate Sector.....	142
5.4	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Breweries Sector.....	144
5.5	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Food and Beverages Sector.....	145
5.6	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Industrial Products Sector.....	146
5.7	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Health Care Sector.....	149
5.8	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Printing and Publishing / Paper Products Sector.....	150
5.9	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Building Materials Sector.....	153
5.10	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in IT Services Sector.....	154
5.11	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Financial Sector.....	157
5.12	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Energy Equipment, Petroleum and Petrol Product Sector.....	158
5.13	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Household Durables Sector.....	159
5.14	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Packaging and Containers Sector.....	161
5.15	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Chemical Sector.....	162
5.16	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Tools and Machines Sector.....	164
5.17	Trend Analysis of Earnings Quality (EQ) in Construction Sector.....	165

ABSTRACT

The study appraised the effectiveness of auditor independence regulations in Nigeria; examined the trend of earnings quality and analysed the factors influencing auditor independence. It also investigated the influence of audit fees on earnings quality and analysed the influence of audit committee characteristics on earnings quality of listed companies in Nigeria. These were with a view to providing information on the impact of auditor independence on the earnings quality of listed companies in Nigeria.

The study employed both primary and secondary data. The population for the study consisted of 194 firms; Finance Director/Chief Accounting Officers of quoted firms; Statutory Auditors and Financial Analysts. Purposive sampling technique was used to select 65 financial and non-financial firms quoted on the Nigerian Stock Exchange (NSE). These comprised 15 financial firms and 50 non-financial firms selected on the basis of continuity in transaction and availability of complete data during the study period. Primary data, with the aid of structured questionnaire, were sourced from Finance Director/Chief Accounting Officers of quoted firms (150); Statutory Auditors (110) and Financial Analysts (90) on the effectiveness of auditor independence regulations and factors influencing auditor independence in Nigeria. The respondents were purposefully selected on the basis of their professionalism in corporate and financial matters. Secondary data on control variables, auditor independence, audit committee characteristics and earnings quality were sourced from the audited Annual Reports and Accounts of the sampled firms and from the NSE factbooks. Data were analysed using content analysis, mean, relative importance index, mean index score, percentages, graphs, tables and Generalised Methods of Moments.

The results of the effectiveness of auditor independence regulations showed that; restriction on advertising with mean index score (MIS) of 4.08; the number of statutory auditors performing the audit (MIS = 3.78); installation of audit committee (MIS = 3.78); restrictions on the unsolicited offering of service (MIS = 3.57); restrictions on the length of audit mandate (MIS = 3.56); approval of the appointment of a statutory auditor by any party other than the appointing party (MIS = 3.54); and limiting auditors from becoming financially dependent on an individual client (MIS = 3.53) were considered effective. The trend analysis results showed that earnings quality improved between 2006 and 2007 (42.15%) but declined in 2008 (46.47%). However, there was consistent improvement in the earnings quality in year 2009, 2010 and 2012 (37.46%, 79% and 97.28%), with a decline in 2013.

The results of the factors influencing auditor independence revealed that BIG4 ($t = -1.981$, $p < 0.05$); audit tenure ($t = -1.78$, $p < 0.05$); profitability ($t = -2.26$, $p < 0.05$); leverage ($t = -1.49$, $p < 0.05$); and inventory with account receivable ($t = -2.10$, $p < 0.05$) had negative significant influence on auditor independence, while size of the firms ($t = 2.36$, $p < 0.05$); and loss ($t = 2.45$, $p < 0.05$) had positive influence on auditor independence in Nigeria. Furthermore, the results of the effect of audit fees on earnings quality showed that, audit fees ($t = -3.25$, $p < 0.05$) had negative significant impact on earnings quality, while previous year earning quality ($t = -5.62$, $p < 0.05$); size of the firm ($t = 3.58$, $p < 0.05$); and growth of the firm ($t = 13.62$, $p < 0.05$) had positive significant impact on earnings quality, unlike leverage (capital structure) with negative significant impact ($t = -8.23$, $p < 0.05$). Finally, the results showed that audit committee meeting had a negative significant impact on earnings ($t = -6.19$, $p < 0.05$), while audit committee size ($t = 0.175$, $p > 0.05$) and management ownership ($t = 0.055$, $p > 0.05$) had positive but insignificant impact on earnings quality. Also, audit

committee independence ($t=-0.86$, $p>0.05$) and board size ($t=-1.06$, $p>0.05$) were found to be negatively related to earnings quality but not significant.

The study concluded that auditor independence and audit committee characteristics were major factors to be considered in the determination of earnings quality among listed companies in Nigeria.

OBAFEMI AWOLOWO UNIVERSITY

OBAFEMI AWOLowo UNIVERSITY

OBAFEMI AWOLOWO UNIVERSITY

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background to the Study

The financial scandals around the world and the collapse of major corporate companies at the end of the 1990s and the beginning of the 21st century, in the USA, South East Asia, Europe and Nigeria have shaken investors' faith in the capital markets and also put in doubt, the efficacy of audited financial statement in promoting transparency and accountability (Salawu, 2011). The collapse of companies like Enron, Adelphia, Tyco and Xerox and particularly Worldcom in 2002 has been linked with audit failure as the audit firms failed to take proper step in detecting significant accounting irregularities.

Audit failure resulting from the failure of professional firms in exercising due care is a global phenomenon that cuts across jurisdictions. The issue is a major concern among the policy makers and investing public across the globe. The incidence of financial crisis witnessed by many nations particularly the developing economy and the attendant loss of confidence by the economic actors, has raised many questions about the expected roles of auditors in corporate financial reporting. For instance, the cry of the investing public had invariably been "Where were the Auditors?" (Akinjobi and Omowumi, 2010). Nigeria is not spared from incidences of audit failure. Notable corporate scandals in the country include Cadbury Nigeria Plc in 2006, African Petroleum Plc, Savannah Bank, African International Bank, Wema Bank, Nampak, Spring Bank, Intercontinental Bank Plc in 2009, Afribank Plc, Bank PHB, Fin Bank, Union Bank and Oceanic Bank all in 2009 etc (SEC 2006, Bakre 2007, Otusanya and Lauwo 2010, Uwuigbe 2013). The case of the five banks that failed the Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN) stress test carried out in 2009, revealed one thing in common; the banks were certified distressed

barely few months after their auditors had given them a clean bill of health (Okoye, Okaro and Okafor 2015).

In October 2006, the Board of Cadbury Nigeria Plc notified the world, its stockholders and regulatory bodies of the discovery of “overstatements” in her accounts, which according to it, has spanned many years. The financial scandals prove to show that the auditors have fallen below expected standards. If a company fails within certain months after being audited, the auditors should be blamed for their failure to alert stakeholders of an impending business failure. Thus, the most commonly question asked whenever there has been a financial scandal is, whether the auditors carried out their duties and obligations properly (Reilly, 2006). Audit failures are costly to investors, the auditors themselves and the wider society as a whole.

External audit is an external governance mechanism that reviews and evaluates client’s internal controls and audits the financial statements in order to prevent material mis-statements. The major role of external auditors is to express an opinion on whether or not an entity’s financial statements show a true and fair view and are free of material misstatements. The external auditor’s report in corporate financial statements is seen as providing key assurance to the shareholders’ interests (Gallegos (2004). Auditors of higher quality are less willing to accept doubtful accounting methods and are more likely to report errors and irregularities revealed during the audit work. Thus, the external auditor is considered to have an impact on the efficacy of the firm’s monitoring function (Murya, 2010). Also, stakeholders rely upon external auditor to provide some assurance that the financial statements of a firm are not misleading.

Prior to corporate governance reforms in many countries, the pressures mounted on the external auditors by the directors in many organisations constituted the focus of several major issues. Also, “creative accounting” practices were widespread. As a response to the devastating

collapse of major corporations, the US passed the Sarbanes-Oxley Act (SOX), which aimed at cleaning up the auditing process (The Economist, 2002). The SOX, for instance, prohibits the offering of non-audit services to audit clients and requires rotation of the lead auditor or coordination partner and the reviewing partner every five years to avoid becoming close to management at a personal level and dependent on the company and the audit fees for advancement within the firm.

The accounting and auditing regulatory bodies in Nigerian such as Stock Exchange Act (1961), Institute of Chartered Accountants of Nigeria Act (1965), Nigerian Deposit Insurance Corporation Act (1988), Companies and Allied Matters Act (1990), Banks and Other Financial Institutions Act (1991), Association of National Accountants of Nigeria Act (1993), Investments and Securities Act (1999), Securities and Exchange Commission Rules and Regulation (1999), Nigerian Insurance Act (2003), and Nigerian Accounting Standards Board Act (2003) (now Financial Reporting Council for Nigeria (FRCN, 2011), and other interested parties, such as institutional shareholders, have taken steps to ensure that financial information is accurate and free from management influence. Thus, as part of mechanisms to ensure sound and reliable corporate reporting, the Companies and Allied Matters Act (1990) had made the audit committee, a body whose function is to oversee the financial reporting process, as well as, the audit of financial statements.

The Audit committee is expected to assist the board of directors in enhancing the transparency and integrity of financial reporting. It is also expected to enhance financial reporting quality by fulfilling its numerous responsibilities including, commenting on and approving accounting policies, reviewing the financial statements and maintaining and reviewing the adequacy of internal controls. Audit committees assumes responsibilities for the appointment and

remuneration of external auditors, and discussing the scope of, and reviewing the auditors;
reviewing the financial reporting process and facilitating the flow of information

For more information, please contact ir-help@oauife.edu.ng

OBAFEMI AWOLowo UNIVERSITY